## Exhibit A

Summons and Complaint and Death Certificate

TILED: ERIE COUNTY CLERK 11/18/2024 08:04 PM INDEX NO. 817088/2024

YSCEF DOC. NO. CASE 1:25-CV-00132-MAV DOCUMENT 1-2 Filed 02/11/25 Page 2 of 26

NYSCEF: 11/18/2024

STATE OF NEW YORK SUPREME COURT : COUNTY OF ERIE

JENNIFER HAGER, as Administrator of the Estate of WILLIAM HAGER, deceased

Index No.

**SUMMONS** 

Plaintiff,

Plaintiff designates Erie County as the place of trial

VS.

. . .

**COUNTY OF ERIE** 

ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF JOHN GARCIA, individually and in his official capacity,

ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPUTIES JOHN DOES 1-5, and ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF'S STAFF JANE DOES 1-5,

The basis of venue is the Plaintiff's residence

Defendants.

TO THE ABOVE-NAMED DEFENDANTS:

YOU ARE HEREBY SUMMONED to answer the Complaint in this action and serve a copy of your answer, or if the Complaint is not served with this Summons, to serve a notice of appearance, on the Plaintiff's Attorneys within TWENTY (20) DAYS after the service of this Summons, exclusive of the day of service (or within THIRTY (30) DAYS after the service is complete if this Summons is not personally delivered to you within the State of New York); and in case of your failure to appear or answer, judgment will be taken against you by default for the relief demanded in the Complaint.

DATED: Buffalo, New York

November 17, 2024

PENBERTHY LAW GROUP LLP

s/Brittany L. Penberthy
Brittany L. Penberthy, Esq.
Attorneys for Plaintiff
Office and P.O. Address
227 Niagara Street
Buffalo, New York 14201

INDEX NO. 817088/2024 4 PM Filed 02/11/25

Page 3 of 26 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/18/2024

STATE OF NEW YORK SUPREME COURT : COUNTY OF ERIE

Index No.

JENNIFER HAGER, as Administrator of the Estate of WILLIAM HAGER, deceased

**COMPLAINT** 

Plaintiff,

VS.

**COUNTY OF ERIE** ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF JOHN GARCIA, individually and in his official capacity, ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPUTIES JOHN DOES 1-5, and ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF'S STAFF JANE DOES 1-5,

Defendants.		

Plaintiff, above named, by her attorneys, PENBERTHY LAW GROUP LLP, for her Complaint against Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE, ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF JOHN GARCIA, ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPUTIES JOHN DOES 1-5, and ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF'S STAFF JANE DOES 1-5 alleges:

## FACTS COMMON TO ALL CLAIMS

- 1. The plaintiff, JENNIFER HAGER, at all times hereinafter mentioned, were and still is a resident of the Town of West Seneca, County of Erie and State of New York.
  - 2. Plaintiff JENNIFER HAGER is the sister of decedent WILLIAM HAGER.
- 3. On or about the 6th day of May, 2024, the plaintiff, JENNIFER HAGER, was appointed Administrator of the Estate of WILLIAM HAGER, pursuant to an Order of the Surrogate's Court of the County of Erie and the State of New York, and Letters of Administration of the Estate of WILLIAM HAGER were served on the plaintiff, JENNIFER HAGER, and the said plaintiff thereupon duly qualified and thereafter acted and is still acting as such Administrator.

PM iled 02/11/25

Defendant COUNTY OF ERIE is and was at all times relevant a municipal corporation,

created, organized, and existing under the laws of the State of New York.

Defendant ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF JOHN GARCIA (hereinafter referred to as

"GARCIA") is and was at all times relevant, the elected Erie County Sheriff and chief executive

officer of the County's detention facility, including Erie County Correctional Facility ("ECCF"),

located at 11581 Walden Avenue, within the Village of Alden, County of Erie and the State of

New York. Defendant GARCIA is sued in both his individual and official capacity.

Defendant GARCIA was and still is a resident of the County of Erie and the State of New

York.

Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Defendant GARCIA was

acting within his authority as the Erie County Sheriff and acting under color of state law.

At all times relevant herein, Defendant GARCIA was the chief policy maker of Erie

County Sheriff's Office.

9. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Defendant GARCIA is

responsible for the supervision, administration, policy, practices, procedures, and customs of the

Erie County Sheriff's Department, an administrative body of Defendant COUNTY OF ERIE, and

is responsible for the hiring, training, discipline, and control of the ECCF staff.

10. At all relevant times to this case, Defendant GARCIA was responsible for training and

supervision of Erie County Sheriff's Deputies, Correction Officers, and/or Personnel, as well as

for creating the policies, practices, and procedures at ECCF.

11. Defendant GARCIA, as the Sheriff of Erie County, is responsible for the day-to-day

operations of ECCF, including the promulgation, implementation and maintenance of ECCF.

: **PM** iled 02/11/25

12. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Defendant COUNTY OF

ERIE was the owner of certain premises commonly known Erie County Correctional Facility,

located at 11581 Walden Avenue, within the Village of Alden, County of Erie and the State of

New York.

13. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Defendants COUNTY

OF ERIE and GARCIA, individually and in his official capacity, by their agents, servants and/or

employees, operated the correctional facility at the aforesaid premises.

14. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Defendants COUNTY

OF ERIE and GARCIA, individually and in his official capacity, by their agents, servants and/or

employees, maintained the correctional facility at the aforesaid premises.

15. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Defendants COUNTY

OF ERIE and GARCIA, individually and in his official capacity, by their agents, servants and/or

employees, managed the correctional facility at the aforesaid premises.

16. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Defendants COUNTY

OF ERIE and GARCIA, individually and in his official capacity, by their agents, servants and/or

employees, controlled the correctional facility at the aforesaid premises.

17. Upon information and belief, Defendant GARCIA, as the Sheriff of Erie County, is

charged by the laws of the State of New York with maintaining ECCF, and is responsible for all

conditions of confinement, health, safety and medical care and treatment of persons incarcerated

herein.

18. That as "policymakers", Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA were aware that

those working at ECCF, Defendants ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPUTIES JOHN DOES 1-5

and ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF'S STAFF JANE DOES 1-5, would encounter inmates with mental

PM -iled 02/11/25

health disorders and emergent medical conditions. They were also aware that those individuals

were at a heightened risk of harm to themselves, and were aware that failure to make adequate

provisions for same could result in the deaths of the inmates. They were further aware that the

training and imposition of proper guidelines were essential to ameliorate this risk. They were also

aware that the failure or inadequacy of said training would result in the deprivation of an inmate's

constitutional rights.

19. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Defendants COUNTY

OF ERIE and GARCIA hired certain staff for employment at the Erie County Correctional Facility,

and whom became responsible for the custody, control, care, and treatment of decedent.

20. ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPUTIES JOHN DOES 1-5, said being Erie County

Sheriff Deputies and/or Correction Officers ("Officers"), whose identities are presently unknown,

were employed by Defendant COUNTY OF ERIE at ECCF during Decedent HAGER's

incarceration, and involved in Decedent HAGER's detention and supervision. They are alleged to

have been acting, at all times relevant to this case, in their individual capacities and under the color

of law within the meaning of 42 U.S.C. § 1983.

21. The Officers were persons engaged in the custody, care, safekeeping, and detention of

Decedent HAGER.

22. ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF'S STAFF JANE DOES 1-5, said being Erie County Sheriff's

Office medical staff and employees involved in Decedent HAGER's medical care, treatment, and

supervision, whose identities are presently unknown, were employed by Defendant COUNTY OF

ERIE at ECCF during Decedent HAGER's incarceration. They are alleged to have been acting, at

all times relevant to this case, in their individual capacities and under the color of law within the

meaning of 42 U.S.C. § 1983.

5

: **PM** -iled 02/11/25

23. Hereafter, reference to "Defendants" shall be deemed to include all named Defendants,

and each of them, unless otherwise indicated, and is not intended to circumvent specificity of a

defendant's actions.

24. Defendants, as owners and operators of the correctional facility, have a legal duty to

provide adequate medical care and supervision for those in their custody.

25. Due to the large number of deaths at Defendants' correctional facilities, the U.S.

Department of Justice began oversight of the Erie County Sheriff's Office, but the same ended in

or about June 2024, with Defendant GARCIA declaring "Technical compliance consultants have

found that Erie County has achieved sustained compliance with the medical and mental health

provisions of the order as well as the Protection from Harm and Environmental Health and Safety

provisions." See "Federal supervision of Erie County jail management ends", available at:

https://www.wivb.com/news/local-news/erie-county/federal-supervision-of-erie-county-jail-

management-ends/.

26. Sadly, immediately after oversight by the U.S. Department of Justice ended, at least 3

other inmates faced fatality while within Defendants' correctional facility.

27. Slightly more than six months prior to the death of Decedent Hager, Defendant GARCIA

conceded "We're set up to fail. We don't have the means to give individuals that come through the

doors adequate medical help ..." See "Why Do People Keep Dying in Erie County's Jails?",

available at https://newrepublic.com/article/171009/erie-county sheriff-garcia-howard.

28. Plaintiff JENNIFER HAGER, as Administratrix of the estate of WILLIAM HAGER, has

brought the instant lawsuit following the wrongful death of her brother, WILLIAM HAGER, on

November 19, 2023, who while incarcerated within the Erie County Correctional Facility, was

caused to die as a result of water intoxication. See Exhibit A, Death Certificate.

**1 PM** −iled 02/11/25

29. In bringing forth the subject claim, Plaintiff JENNIFER HAGER alleges Decedent's death was a result, in part, of all Defendants' negligence and medical malpractice.

30. Suffering from well known and documented mental illness, Decedent HAGER had several

unfortunate occasions to be within the custody of Defendants' correctional facility.

31. Decedent HAGER's mental health challenges were not unknown nor newly onset,

including his diagnosis of schizophrenia.

32. Rather, upon his readmission to Defendants' correctional facility in 2023, Defendants

classified Decedent HAGER as suffering from mental illness, but failed to provide him the proper

medical treatment and supervision.

33. During his time in Defendants' correctional facility immediately prior to his death,

Decedent HAGER's mental health began to worsen, which should have triggered greater

supervision and care.

34. Defendants' medical providers and staffidly stood by and did nothing to help or intervene

with the excessive consumption of water by Decedent HAGER, despite the knowledge of his

mental health limitations and diagnoses.

35. Importantly, the over consumption of water is known have fatal effects, and a heightened

likelihood of affecting those suffering from schizophrenia.

36. Nonetheless, Defendants' medical providers and staff continued to provide Decedent with

unrestricted access to water knowing his mental health condition and worsening state.

37. Defendants' medical providers and staff failed to provide proper medical aid or

intervention to Decedent's decline in mental health.

: **PM** iled 02/11/25

38. Through Defendant GARCIA's actions and constitutionally infirm supervision and

supervisory policies, an individual who was experiencing an increasing mental health episode was

denied proper treatment or supervision to prevent harm to oneself.

39. Defendants' failed to provide adequate and required medical care to Decedent HAGER, a

person in their custody.

40. It is well known throughout the correctional, law enforcement, and medical communities

that a person suffering from schizophrenic disorders have a heightened risk of potential delusions

of excessive thirst, or tendencies towards compulsive and unnecessary water intake, which can

See "Death from self-induced water intoxication among patients with result in death.

schizophrenic disorders.", available at: https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/3973577/; see also

"Inmate's water-intoxication death: Family settles lawsuit against prison workers" available at:

https://www.mlive.com/news/grand-rapids/2016/08/inmates water-intoxication dea.html.

41. Defendants' willful and deliberate indifference to Decedent HAGER's serious medical

needs, and lack of adequate supervision, directly led to Decedent HAGER's untimely, easily

preventable, and unjustifiable death.

42. Specific to Defendant GARCIA, individually and in his official capacity, he failed to:

sufficiently monitor or treat, or supervise and/or train, those responsible for Decedent HAGER;

adequately screen or supervise and/or train, those responsible for screening Decedent HAGER for

medical conditions; failed to timely or adequately respond to requests for medical care or supervise

and/or train, those responsible for Decedent HAGER; and denied or delayed for excessive periods

the provision of necessary chronic and specialty care, including that involving one's mental health,

or supervise and/or train, those responsible for Decedent HAGER.

SCEF DOC. NO. Case 1.25-cv-00132-MAV Document 1-2 Filed 02/11/25 Page 10 of 26 NYSCEF: 11/18/202

43. Defendant GARCIA's failure to provide adequate medical care and supervision resulted

in the death of Decedent HAGER.

44. Defendant GARCIA has been aware of the constitutionally and legally inadequate care,

supervisions, and conditions in his jail even before being elected sheriff, thereby possessing actual

and constructive notice of these ongoing and recurring violations prior to the death of Decedent

HAGER.

45. Defendants ERIE COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPUTIES JOHN DOES 1-5 and ERIE

COUNTY SHERIFF'S STAFF JANE DOES 1-5 failed to: sufficiently monitor or treat Decedent

HAGER; failed to adequately screen Decedent HAGER for medical conditions; failed to timely or

adequately respond to requests for medical care or proper supervision of Decedent HAGER; failed

to properly assess and manage the heightened mental health deterioration of Decedent HAGER;

failed to limit excessive water consumption by Decedent HAGER; failed to elevate Decedent

HAGER's level of medical care and treatment, including removal to an outside facility; failed to

intervene in Decedent HAGER's self-harm; and denied or delayed for excessive periods the

provision of necessary chronic and specialty care, including mental health treatment of Decedent

HAGER.

46. Defendants failures to provide adequate medical care, treatment, and supervision resulted

in the death of Decedent HAGER.

47. Upon information and belief, Defendants were aware of Decedent HAGER's reluctance

to eat and increasing erratic behaviors in the days leading up to his death.

48. Upon information and belief, W. HAGER was found unresponsive in his cell at ECCF on or

about November 18 or 19, 2023.

**PM** iled 02/11/25

49. Following an autopsy, Decedent's death was confirmed to the be result of "water

intoxication." See Exhibit A.

50. This is a civil action seeking damages for personal injuries due to negligence, medical

malpractice and wrongful death under State Law and for damages pursuant to 42 U.S.C. 1983.

51. Decedent HAGER's death was in a few months following Defendants' receipt of the report

of the New York State Commission of Correction Final Report In the Matter of the Death of Michael

Frears, wherein the Commission determined the facility failed to conduct supervisory rounds that

comport with the requirements of New York State Minimum Standard 9 NYCRR §7003.3. Available

at: https://scoc.ny.gov/system/files/documents/2023/09/frears michael erie hc.pdf.

52. Here too, Defendants failed to properly monitor Decedent HAGER so as to ensure he was

not a threat to others, or more importantly here, himself.

53. In this instance, and upon information and belief, neither the Attorney General's Office

nor the State Commission on Corrections has completed their investigation into the death of

Decedent HAGER. Such final reports will provide a basis for additional claims herein, and the

potential identification of further responsible parties.

54. Prior to his death, Defendants have been advised the State Commission on Corrections on

at least four occasions between 2016-2024 to properly determine the competency of jail health

care providers.

55. Defendants have knowingly and recklessly denied proper medical care to his inmates,

causing numerous investigations and deaths.

56. Defendants were aware of the complaints against the inadequate medical care and

supervision of their inmates, minimally by the reports of the New York State Commission of

Corrections, who all tragically predeceased Decedent HAGER, including that of Michael Frears

YSCEF DOC. NO. 125-CV-00132-MAV Document 1-2 Filed 02/11/25 Page 12 of 26 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/18/202

(death March 13, 2021), James A. Ellis (death Nov. 30, 2021), Sean Riordan (death June 14, 2022),

and William B. Henley (death Nov. 27, 2022).

57. Failure by medical staff to properly assess, failure to notify and consult with a mental

health professional or physician.

58. Defendants' failures herein indicate inadequate supervision of medical staff and health

services delivery.

59. The condition precedent to suit concerning New York General Municipal Law §50-e's

Notice of Claim requirements have been performed relative to Plaintiff JENNIFER HAGER as

Administratrix of the estate of WILLIAM HAGER, who subsequently submitted to a General

Municipal Law § 50- h examination on or about June 17, 2024. To date, Defendants have failed,

refused, or neglected to settle the instant claim, and at least thirty days have elapsed since service

of said Notice of Claim.

60. Such Notice of Claim set forth the name and post office address of Plaintiff, the name and

post office address of her attorneys, the nature of the claims, the time when, the place where, and

the manner in which the claim arose, together with the items of damages and injuries known to

exist, and after receipt of said Notice of Claim, as aforesaid, Defendants have failed and neglected

to adjust or pay said claim. Said Notice of Claims was served upon Defendants within ninety (90)

days of the date upon which the claim arose.

AS AND FOR PLAINTIFF'S FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS

(Medical Negligence Under New York Law)

61. Plaintiff hereby repeats and re-alleges each factual allegation contained in preceding

paragraphs, "1" through "57," with the same force and effect as if set forth fully herein.

11

NYSCEF DOC. NO Case 1:25-cv-00132-MAV Document 1-2 Filed 02/11/25

62. Upon admission of Decedent HAGER to the ECCF, a jail that was maintained by

Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA, the aforesaid Defendants had a statutory duty,

minimally under New York Correction Law § 501, to provide a jail physician and/or medical care

and treatment to Decedent while he was in the custody of the Defendants.

63. Employees, independent contractors, and/or other subordinates and/or those rendering

medical care to Decedent HAGER, negligently failed to diagnose and/or properly treat Decedent's

declining mental health condition.

64. Defendants and others in the employ or subordinates of the Defendants COUNTY OF

ERIE and GARCIA, failed to refer Decedent HAGER to a hospital relative to and/or administer

the appropriate treatment for this mental health decomposition.

65. Furthermore, Defendants, and/or others in the employ and acting in furtherance of the

duties of the COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA, had actual and/or constructive knowledge of

Decedent's deteriorating mental health, failed to render adequate medical treatment, failed to refer

him to a hospital, failed to intervene to prevent self-harm, or otherwise failed to properly monitor

his condition.

66. Defendants and/or others in the employ and acting in furtherance of the duties of

Defendants jointly and/or severally failed to refer the Decedent to a hospital or mental health

facility/physician.

67. Defendants knew, or should have known, that Decedent HAGER was experiencing a

mental health crisis while confined within ECCF.

68. Additionally, the failures of Defendants, and others in the employ or subordinates of

COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA, to refer Decedent HAGER to a higher level of care resulted in

Decedent not receiving appropriate medical intervention and ultimately caused his death, as further

12

 $_{
m IYSCEF\ DOC.\ NO.\ Case\ 1:25-cv-00132-MAV}$  Document 1-2 Filed 02/11/25 Page 14 of 26 NYSCEF:  $_{
m 11/18/202}$ 

evidenced, in part, by violations of 9 NYCRR § 7010.1(b), which requires prompt screening to

identify serious or life-threatening medical conditions.

69. As a result of these failures constituting medical malpractice of Defendants, and/or others

in the employ and acting in furtherance of the duties of COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA,

Decedent was improperly and inadequately treated, and was otherwise left untreated.

70. As a result of the joint and several failures of Defendants and others in the employ of and

subordinates of COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA concerning the provision of medical care and

treatment to Decedent, he was caused to die and sustain great pain and suffering and physical

anguish prior to his passing.

71. Plaintiff alleges Defendants engaged in a negligent practice in failing to provide and make

available an appropriate jail physician and/or mental health professional, as it was statutorily

obligated to, as either a matter of practice or in the instant case.

72. Upon information and belief, Defendants, and/or others in the employ and acting in

furtherance of the duties of COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA, failed to ensure the appropriate

supervision of Decedent to prevent self-harm, which therein resulted in his death.

73. Upon information and belief, the incident herein before described and the resultant injuries

and death were caused as a result of the negligence, carelessness, recklessness and/or unlawful

conduct on the part of the agents, servants, and/or employees of Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE

and GARCIA, and more particularly, among other things, in their failing and omitting to properly

and in a timely manner administer, provide and/or ensure for adequate medical/mental health

treatment, including transport, assessments, monitoring, examinations and medications; in failing

to detect an inmate experiencing a medical crisis; in failing to properly and in a timely manner

respond to Decedent's medical/mental health issues, symptoms and need for treatment and/or

13

REGET VED TRIBUET - 11, 10, 20

medication; in deliberately, purposefully, and knowingly denying detainees like Decedent access

to necessary medical/mental treatment; in deploying unlawful force because of illness and/or need

for medical aide; and in negligently furthering the deterioration of Decedent's medical condition

by ignoring his symptoms, and allowing the excessive consumption of water.

74. Upon information and belief, the incident hereinbefore described and the resultant injuries

and death caused as a result of the negligence, carelessness, recklessness and/or unlawful conduct

on the part of the agents, servants, and/or employees of Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and

GARCIA was caused by those acts and omissions of the agents, servants and/or employees of

DEFENDANT GARCIA, in his failure to properly and adequately train, supervise, instruct his

employees, staff and/or officers with regard proper mental health and illness care; the proper and

timely medical treatment of detainees; in failing to properly and adequately train, supervise,

instruct their employees, staff and/or officers in recognizing the signs and symptoms of

deteriorating mental health and/or potential increase in self-harm; in the failure to respond to

Decedent HAGER's medical crisis in an expeditious manner; and in violating Decedent HAGER's

state and federal constitutional and statutory rights as well as internal policies by failing to provide

adequate medical care, and failing to take reasonable measures to guarantee the safety of Decedent

HAGER.

75. Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA are vicariously liable for the negligence of

its subordinates as set forth in the preceding paragraphs.

76. As a result of the foregoing, Plaintiff has sustained general and special damages in an

amount that exceeds the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts that would otherwise have

jurisdiction.

77. Wherefore, Plaintiff prays for judgment as herein set forth below.

14

INDEX NO. 817088/2024 Page 16 of 26 NYSCEF: 11/18/2024

> AS AND FOR PLAINTIFF'S SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS

(42 U.S.C. §1983 and Fourteenth Amendment – **Deliberate Indifference to Serious Medical Need)** 

78. Plaintiff hereby repeats and re-alleges each factual allegation contained in preceding

paragraphs, "1" through "74," with the same force and effect as if set forth fully herein.

79. Decedent HAGER, while under the care, custody and control of Defendants, was caused

to suffer serious injuries, due to Defendants' failure ensure for and/or provide timely and proper

medical/mental health treatment; in their failure to provide medications and proper treatment for

declining mental health; the denial of treatment by Defendants amounts to deliberate indifference

to a serious medical need, in violation of the Fourteenth Amendments' prohibition against cruel

and unusual punishment and 42U.S.C. §1983; in their failure and refusal to make a reasonable

accommodation by providing Decedent HAGER with access to proper treatment and medications

when knowing of his mental health diagnoses, thereby discriminating against him on the basis of

his mental health disabilities and unconstitutionally deprived him of his liberty and he was

otherwise tortuously and maliciously harmed by the actions of Defendants, all in violation of Title

42 of the United States Code, Section 1983 et. seq. and the Americans with Disabilities Act. Said

negligent and improper delay in medical treatment led to the untimely and wrongful death of

Decedent Hager on November 19, 2023.

80. Being found to exhibit increasing erratic behaviors or mental health disorders but resulting

in unresponsive or inadequate medical attention, constituted a serious medical need that was left

unanswered.

81. Notwithstanding the medically serious condition of Decedent, Defendants, being aware of

Decedent's deteriorating mental health and symptoms and actions consistent with mental health

issues, recklessly and with deliberate indifference ignored Decedent's needs, failed to properly

15

rscef doc. No. Case 1.25-cv-00132-MAV Document 1-2 Filed 02/11/25 Page 17 of 26 NYSCEF: 11/18/202

monitor him despite being obligated to do the same, and recklessly took no action to summon or

obtain appropriate medical assistance for Decedent HAGER.

82. Upon information and belief, Defendants preventing Decedent from the appropriate

medical/mental health care despite experiencing a medical crisis went against the medical standard

of care that was warranted.

83. Defendants knew of and disregarded or should have known of the excessive risk of harm

to oneself in the excessive consumption of water, especially of those suffering from schizophrenia,

nonetheless Decedent was not provided appropriate medical care or attention to prevent the same.

84. The failure to provide and/or denial of access to the appropriate standard of care caused

Decedent HAGER physical and psychological suffering and injuries resulting in death.

85. The denial of treatment and failure by Defendants to appropriate medical care constitutes

a deliberate indifference to a serious medical need, in violation of the Fourteenth Amendment and

42 U.S.C. § 1983.

86. As a result of the foregoing, Plaintiff has sustained general and special damages in an

amount that exceeds the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts that would otherwise have

jurisdiction.

87. Wherefore, Plaintiff prays for judgment as herein set forth below.

AS AND FOR PLAINTIFF'S THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS

(Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. Section 1983 - Monell Claim-Municipal Liability)

88. Plaintiff hereby repeats and re-alleges each factual allegation contained in preceding

paragraphs, "1" through "84," with the same force and effect as if set forth fully herein.

89. Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA, established, condoned, ratified, and/or

encouraged customs, policies, patterns, and practices that directly and proximately caused the

INDEX NO. 817088/2024
Page 18 of 26
Page 18 of 26
Page 19 of 26

deprivation of the civil and constitutional rights of Decedent HAGER, and the damages and injuries described herein. Defendants did so with deliberate indifference to the rights of the detainee. These written and unwritten policies, customs, patterns, and practices included: a) Failing to adequately staff their department with sufficient deputies, staff, and employees (including health care workers), for welfare checks, medical assessment, monitoring, and medical treatment. b) Failing to train, supervise and discipline deputies, staff, and employees at ECCF responsible for welfare checks, medical assessment, monitoring, and medical treatment. c) Failing to utilize qualitative benchmarks to assess the quality of medical care ECCF provides to its detainees. d) Failing to take steps to ensure that deputies, staff, and employees at ECCF do not allow inmates, especially those suffering from mental deficits, an unhealthy and/or excessive amount of water. e) Failing to have in place, or failing to follow, a policy or procedure to prevent officers from failing to recognize and limit excessive consumption of water, and/or improperly isolating detainees experiencing medical issues. f) Retaining deputies, staff, and employees, when they knew or should have known of their propensity to fail to render appropriate medical aid, attention, and/or supervision. g) Failing to properly screen, during the booking process, and supervise thereafter, prisoner, inmate, and/or detainee for serious medical/mental health needs. h) Failing and omitting to properly and in a timely manner administer, provide and/or ensure for adequate medical treatment, including transport, assessments, monitoring, examinations, and medications of those suffering from mental health ailments. i) Failing to properly and in a timely manner respond to medical complaints, symptoms, and requests for treatment and/or medication. j) Deliberately, purposefully, and knowingly denying detainees access to necessary medical treatment. k) Failing to properly and adequately train, supervise, instruct their employees, staff and/or officers about the proper and timely medical treatment of detainees suffering from mental health deficits; and in

INDEX NO. 817088/2024 4 PM Filed 02/11/25

recognizing the signs and symptoms to prevent water intoxication, and l) Failing to immediately

seek hospital treatment for detainees in need of it.

90. At all relevant times, Defendants acted unreasonably and with deliberate indifference and

disregard for the constitutional and civil rights of the detainee Decedent HAGER.

91. The actions (or inactions) of Defendants were malicious, willful, wanton, and reckless.

92. The failures by Defendants to supervise, train, or discipline personnel was so obvious that

the failure to do so amounted to a policy of "deliberate indifference."

93. Such acts as alleged herein were the proximate cause of injury and damage to the inmate,

detainee, and/or prisoner, including Decedent HAGER.

94. As a result of the foregoing, Plaintiff has sustained general and special damages in an

amount that exceeds the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts that would otherwise have

jurisdiction.

95. Wherefore, Plaintiff prays for judgment as herein set forth below.

AS AND FOR PLAINTIFF'S FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS

(Unlawful Discrimination Against Qualified Individuals with Disabilities - ADA)

96. Plaintiff hereby repeats and re-alleges each factual allegation contained in preceding

paragraphs, "1" through "92," with the same force and effect as if set forth fully herein.

97. Erie County Correctional Facility ("ECCF"), which is owned and/or operated by

Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA, is a public facility subject to the Americans with

Disabilities Act ("ADA").

98. Mental health conditions are a "disability" under the ADA. See 42 U.S.C. §12102 and

12131(2); 28 C.F.R. §35.108.

YSCEF DOC. NO. CASE 1.25-cv-00132-MAV Document 1-2 Filed 02/11/25 Page 20 of 26
RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/18/2024

99. The ADA applies to individuals, such as Decedent HAGER, who require or are receiving

treatment for mental health conditions.

100. Defendants denied Decedent HAGER the benefit of medical programs through ECCF on

the basis of his disability.

101. Defendants refused to and/or failed to make a reasonable accommodation to Decedent

HAGER knowing of his prior diagnosis of schizophrenia, or mental health deficits.

102. Defendants could have provided special housing or referred him to an appropriate facility

or mental health professional to best monitor and control Decedent HAGER's mental health

disorders, thereby discriminating against him on the basis of disability, even though such

accommodation would in no way alter the nature of the healthcare program.

103. Upon information and belief, Defendants do not deny medically necessary, physician-

prescribed medications, programs, or accommodations to other detainees with serious, chronic

medical conditions, such as migraines, sleep disorders, or diabetes.

104. As a result of the foregoing, Plaintiff has sustained general and special damages in an

amount that exceeds the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts that would otherwise have

jurisdiction.

105. Wherefore, Plaintiff prays for judgment as herein set forth below.

AS AND FOR PLAINTIFF'S FIFTH CAUSE OF ACTION AGAINST DEFENDANTS COUNTY OF ERIE AND SHERIFF GARCIA

(Negligent Hiring, Training, and Supervision Under New York Law)

106. Plaintiff hereby repeats and re-alleges each factual allegation contained in preceding

paragraphs, "1" through "102," with the same force and effect as if set forth fully herein.

107. At all times mentioned herein, Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA were

responsible for establishing the municipal policies relative to procuring medical care and treatment

of pretrial detainees in the custody of Defendants, and/or practices so widespread and consistent that, although not expressly authorized, constituted a custom or usage of which a supervising policy maker of the County and GARCIA must have been aware. The policymakers failed to provide adequate training or supervision to subordinates to such an extent that it amounts to

deliberate indifference to the rights of those who come into contact with the municipal and/or law

enforcement employees.

108. Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA's deficiencies in hiring, training, and adequately supervising their employees was highly likely to inflict the particular injury suffered by the Plaintiffs.

109. As alleged herein and above, Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA failed to hire, supervise and train Officers and Personnel to adequately screen, monitor, and care for inmates at ECCF.

110. Due to Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA's failure to hire, supervise and train Officers and Personnel, this resulted the death of Decedent HAGER.

111. Defendants further maintained policies and practices insufficient to mitigate the serious risk to the safety and security of staff, inmates, and the public during serious mental health concerns. This is a known risk to Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA.

112. As alleged herein and above, Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA failed to hire, supervise and train Officers and Personnel to adequately address an inmates' medical needs, including the issues Decedent suffered.

113. Identifying and adequately addressing the medical needs of inmates requires specialized training, and upon information and belief, Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA failed to hire the appropriate personnel for this role.

INDEX NO. 817088/2024 4 PM -iled 02/11/25

Page 22 of 26 NYSCEF: 11/18/2024

114. Defendants COUNTY OF ERIE and GARCIA, knew and/or should have known that a

failure to adequately train, supervise and monitor the conduct of Officers and Personnel would

likely result in unreasonable danger to inmates.

115. As a result of the foregoing, Plaintiff has sustained general and special damages in an

amount that exceeds the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts that would otherwise have

jurisdiction.

116. Wherefore, Plaintiff prays for judgment as herein set forth below.

AS AND FOR PLAINTIFF'S SIXTH CAUSE OF ACTION AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS

(Negligence Under New York Law)

117. Plaintiff hereby repeats and re-alleges each factual allegation contained in preceding

paragraphs, "1" through "113," with the same force and effect as if set forth fully herein

118. At all times material, Defendants knew that Decedent HAGER was in their custody and

owed him a duty of reasonable care and supervision.

119. Defendants breached their duty to exercise reasonable care in safe-guarding Decedent, by

failing to follow develop protocols and procedures designed to keep such detainees reasonably

safe and healthy/mentally stable, and/or alternatively by failing to follow existing protocols and

procedures designed to do the same.

120. As a result of the foregoing, Plaintiff has sustained general and special damages in an

amount that exceeds the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts that would otherwise have

jurisdiction.

121. Wherefore, Plaintiff prays for judgment as herein set forth below.

AS AND FOR PLAINTIFF'S SEVENTH CAUSE OF ACTION AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS

(Wrongful Death Under New York Law)

21

YSCEF DOC. NO. 125-CV-00132-MAV Document 1-2 Filed 02/11/25 Page 23 of 26 NYSCEF: 11/18/202

122. Plaintiff hereby repeat and re-allege each factual allegation contained in preceding

paragraphs, "1" through "118," with the same force and effect as if set forth fully herein.

123. Decedent left surviving family members.

124. Decedent's family members were dependent upon Decedent for support and maintenance,

which they are now deprived of as a result of the aforesaid incident.

125.As a result of the aforesaid incident, medical, funeral, and burial expenses have been

incurred.

126.By reason of Decedent's death caused by the negligence and reckless disregard of the

Defendants as aforesaid, his distributes and next of kin have sustained damages in an amount that

exceeds the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts that would otherwise have jurisdiction.

127. Wherefore, Plaintiff prays for judgment as herein set forth below.

## RELIEF REQUESTED

Plaintiff, respectfully requests that this Court:

a. Exercise jurisdiction over Plaintiff's claims and grant her a jury trial;

b. Award Plaintiff for general damages in an amount to be ascertained according to proof,

and interest on said sums from the date of Judgment;

c. Award Plaintiff for special damages in an amount to be ascertained according to proof,

and interest on said sums from the date of Judgment;

d. Award Plaintiff for punitive damages against the individual named Defendants in an

amount sufficient to punish them and deter others from similar conduct;

e. Award Plaintiff for reasonable attorney's fees pursuant to 42 U.S.C. Section 1988;

f. Award Plaintiff for any and all additional statutory damages allowed by law;

g. Award Plaintiff for costs of suit herein incurred; and

FILED: ERIE COUNTY CLERK 11/18/2024 08:04 PM INDEX NO. 817088/2024

PAGE 1:25-CV-00132-MAV Document 1-2 Filed 02/11/25 Page 24 of 26

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/18/2024

F DOC. NO. TO THE STORY TO SHARE THE STORY THE SECRET TO STORY THE SECRET THE STORY THE SECRET THE STORY THE SECRET THE S

h. For such other and further relief as this Court deems just and proper.

DATED: Buffalo, New York

November 17, 2024

## PENBERTHY LAW GROUP LLP

s/ Brittany L. Penberthy
Brittany L. Penberthy, Esq.
Attorneys for Plaintiff
Office and P.O. Address
227Niagara Street
Buffalo, New York 14201
(716) 803-8402

INDEX NO. 817088/2024 11/18/ 08:04 COUNTY CLERK PM NYSCEF DOC. NO. Case 1:25-cv-00132-MAV Page 25 of 26 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/18/2024 DOH-1961 (8/2011) RECORDED DISTRICT **NEW YORK STATE** 1455 DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH REGISTER NUMBER 131-2023-00092039 CERTIFICATE OF DEATH 818 investigation; Injury-DateTime of Injury was Amended on Feb-28-2024 - Cause of Death-Line A Description was Pending investigation: Injury-DateTime of Injury wa e.g., factory, friend's home) was blank; Injury-Address City was blank; Injury-Address STATE FILE NUMBER L NAME: FIRST 2. SEX 3A. DATE OF DEATH William H. Hager Male 11 19 2023 08:23 PM 4A. PLACE OF DEATH: (Check one) HOSPITAL DOA ER HOSPITAL HOSPICE OTHER 4B. IF FACILITY, DATE ADMITTED (Specify) DAY 11 19 2023 4C. NAME OF FACILITY: (If not facility, gire address 4D. LOCALITY: (Check one and specify) 4E. COUNTY OF DEATH CITY VILLAGE TOWN Sisters Of Charity Hospital, St Joseph Campus ☐ Cheektowaga Town Erie 4F. MEDICAL RECORD NO. 4G. WAS DECEDENT TRANSFERRED FROM ANOTHER INSTITUTION? (II yes, specify institution name, city or town, county and state) NO 5. DATE OF BIRTH 6A, AGE IN YEARS: 6B. IF UNDER 1 YEAR ENTER: 6C. IF UNDER 1 DAY ENTER: 7A. CITY AND STATE OF BIRTH: (If not USA, Country and MONTH YEAR 44 05 1979 yrs Buffalo, New York 8. SERVED IN U.S. ARMED FORCES? (Specify years) 9. DECEDENT OF HISPANIC ORIGIN? Check the boxes that best describe whether the decedent is 5 10. DECEDENT'S RACE: Checkens or more recent to A Mo, not Spanish/Hispanic/Latino B Yes, Mexican, Mexican American, Chicano A White/Caucasian B Black or African American C Asian Indian D Chinese □0 ×1 C Yes, Puerto Rican D Yes, Cuban E Filipino F Japanese G Korean E Yes, Other Spanish/Hispanic/Latino (Specify) J Native Hawaiian K Guamanian or Chamorro M Samoan 11. DECEDENT'S EDUCATION: Check the hox that best describes the highest degree or level of sch ol completed at the time of death 1 ☐ ≤ 8th grade N American Indian or Alaska Native (specify) 2 2 9th-12th grade; no diploma 3 High school graduate or GED 4 Some college credit, but no degree 5 Associate's degree P Other Asian (specify) 6 Bachelor's degree R Other Pacific Islander (specify) 7 Master's degree 8 Doctorate/Professional degree S Other (specify) 12. SOCIAL SECURITY NUMBER: 13. MARITAL STATUS: 14. SURVIVING SPOUSE: Enter birth name of spous if married or separated. NEVER MARRIED MARRIED DIVORCED 4 WIDOWED 075-64-9329 XI □ 3 □ 5 □ 2 15A. USUAL OCCUPATION: (Do not enter retired) 15B. KIND OF BUSINESS OR INDUSTRY 15C. NAME AND LOCALITY OF COMPANY OR FIRM Disabled N/A 16A. RESIDENCE: (State or Country if not USA) 168. County or Region/Province if not USA: 16C. LOCALITY: (Check one and specify) CITY VILLAGE TOWN 16F, IF CITY OR VILLAGE, IS RESIDENCE WITHIN CITY OR VILLAGE LIMITS?

YES NO IF NO. SPECIFY TOWN: NY Erie West Seneca Town 16D, STREET AND NUMBER OF RESIDENCE 16E. ZIP CODE: 136 Heather Hill Drive 14224 17. BIRTH NAME OF FATHER / PARENT: MI LAST 18. BIRTH NAME OF MOTHER / PARENT: LAST Paul W. Hager Carol Diamond 19A. NAME OF INFORMANT: 19B. MAILING ADDRESS: (include zip code) Jennifer Hager 136 Heather Hill Drive, West Seneca Town, NY 14224 20A, 1 DBURIAL 2 MI CREMATION 3 □ REMOVAL 4 □ HOLD MONTH DAY 20B. PLACE OF BURIAL, CREMATION, REMOVAL OR OTHER DISPOSITION. 5 DONATION 20C. LOCATION: (City or town and state) YEAR € □ ENTOMBNENT 11 2023 Mt. Calvary Cremation & Remembrance Center | Cheektowaga, New York ed on Feb-28-2024 - Pronouncement - Manner of Death was Pending Investigation Amended njury-At Work was blank; Place of Injury - Place of Injury Description (Type of place, e.g., factowas blank; Injury-Describe How Injury Occurred was blank 21A, NAME AND ADDRESS OF FUNERAL HOME Hoy Funeral Home Inc. 21B. REGISTRATION NUMBER 3855 Seneca Street, West Seneca Town, NY 14224 00811 22A. NAME OF FUNERAL DIRECTOR 228. SIGNATURE OF FUNERAL DIRECTOR 22C. REGISTRATION NUMBER: Mark J Janik Mark J Janik Electronically Signed 11727 23A, SIGNATURE OF REGISTRAR: 23B. DATE FILED: MONTH DAY 24A. BURIAL OR REMOVAL PERMIT ISSUED BY YEAR 24B. DATE ISSUED: MONTH DAY ▶ Kimberly A Burst Electronically Signed YEAR 11 21 2023 Carol Driscoll 11 2023 ITEMS 25 THRU 33 COMPLETED BY CERTIFYING PHYSICIAN -- OR -- CORONER/CORONER'S PHYSICIAN OR MEDICAL EXAMINER 25A. CERTIFICATION: To the best of my knowledge, death occurred at the time, date and place and due to the causes stated. Certifier's Name License No .: Signature Katherine Maloney, ME Katherine Maloney, ME Year 250114 Electronically Signed 11 20 2023 501 Kensington Avenue, Buffalo, NY 14214 25B. If coroner is not a physician, enter Coroner's Physician's name & title License No. 25C. If certifler is not attending physician, enter Attending Physician's name & title: License No. 26A. Attending physician attended deceased: FROM 26B. Deceased last seen alive by attending physician: 11 19 2023 AT 08:23 PM 27. MANNÉB OF DEATH DN 28. WAS CASE REFERRED TO CORONER OR MEDICAL EXAMINER? UNDETERMINED CIRCUMSTANCES PENDING INVESTIGATION 29A. AUTOPSY 29B. IF YES, WERE FINDINGS USED TO DETERMINE CAUSE OF DEATH? NATURAL CAUSE ... ACCIDENT HOMICIDE SUICIDE NO YES REFUSED 3 □ 5 □ 6 0 NO 1 X YES X1 0 \ NO 1 X YES CONFIDENTIAL SEE INSTRUCTION SHEET FOR COMPLETING CAUSE OF DEATH CONFIDENTIAL 30. DEATH WAS CAUSED BY: (ENTER DNLY ONE CAUSE PER LINE FOR (A), (B), AND (C).) APPROXIMATE INTERVAL BETWEEN CONSET AND DEATH PART'I. IMMEDIATE CAUSE: (A) Water intoxication DUE TO OR AS A CONSEQUENCE OF: (B) <<<>>>> 1.21 <<<>>>> DUE TO OR AS A CONSEQUENCE OF (0) <<<>>>> 9 PART II. OTHER SIGNIFICANT CONDITIONS CONTRIBUTING TO DEATH BUT NOT RELATED TO CAUSE GIVEN IN PART I (A): <>>>> <<<>>> DID TOBACCO USE CONTRIBUTE TO DEATH? Injury-31A IF INJURY, DATE: 0 ☐ NO 1 ☐ YES 2 ☐ PROBABLY 3 ☑ UNKNOWN 31B. INJURY LOCALITY: (City or town and county and state)

31C. DESCRIBE HOW INJURY OCCURRED:

Excessive water intake

1 Progrant at time of death

31D. PLACE OF INJURY

2 Not pregrant, but pregnant within 42 days of death

31E. INJURY AT WORK?

NO

X 0 

33B, DATE OF DELIVERY

Amended

County

blank;

11 99 2023 Unknown

31F. IF TRANSPORTATION INJURY, SPECIFY:

1 Driver/Operator 2 Passenger 3 Pedestri

Alden Town, Erie, NY

YES

33A, IF FEMALE:

0 Not pregnant within list year

32. WAS DECEDENT HOSPITALIZED IN NO

**18/2024 08:04 PM** Document 1-2 Filed 02/11/25 INDEX NO. 817088/2024

RIE COUNTY CLERK 11 Page 26 of 26 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/18/2024

059916

059916

Safety Features Used In This Form

- 1. Watermark on back is visible when document is held up to a light source.
- 2. Press number on document.
- 3. "VOID" appears on photocopies made on either a black and white or color photocopier.

VITALS

059916

I HEREBY CERTIFY THAT THIS IS A TRUE AND CORRECT COPY OF A CERTIFICATE ON FILE IN THE OFFICE OF THE LOCAL REGISTRAR OF VITAL STATISTICS.

Vinkerly

MAR 0 5 202 DATED

KIMBERLY A. BURST, TOWN CLERK Registrar of Vital Records District No. 1455, Town of Cheektowaga Erle County New York

TRUE CERTIFIED COPY ONLY CCEPTABLE IF SIGNED AND SEALED TOWN CLERK OF CHEEKTOWAGA